

**ADDRESSING THE NEW HUMAN BIOTECHNOLOGIES:
A COMPENDIUM OF CORE VALUES AND PRINCIPLES**

**A BACKGROUNDER FOR
THE TARRYTOWN MEETINGS
MONDAY JULY 25 AFTERNOON PLENARY DISCUSSION**

INTRODUCTION

This compendium draws on twenty-five documents – conventions, declarations, legislation, reports, and guidelines – that focus on human biotechnologies and related topics. From these we have extracted the motivating values and principles they cite.

The documents were variously prepared under the auspices of international bodies, national governments, United States presidential bioethics councils, NGOs and policy organizations, religious bodies and independent scholars. Familiarity with these documents can help inform our discussions here at the Tarrytown Meeting about the values and principles at the core of our own efforts.

This compendium is not exhaustive. Rather, it seeks to demonstrate both the diversity and commonality of values and principles invoked when addressing new human biotechnologies. Your feedback and suggestions regarding additional documents that might be included is truly welcome.

This compendium was prepared by Emily Smith Beitiks, with help from Richard Hayes and Pete Shanks, and with suggestions from many colleagues. Contact Emily at esbeitiks@geneticsandsociety.org.

CONTENTS

International Organizations/Initiatives

- A. Council of Europe, *Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity of the Human Being with Regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine: Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine* (The Oviedo Convention), 1997
- B. UNESCO, *Universal Declaration on the Human Genome and Human Rights*, 1998
- C. European Union, *The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union*, 2000
- D. The Earth Charter Initiative, *The Earth Charter*, 2000
- E. UNESCO, *Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights*, 2005

Comprehensive National Legislation

- F. Argentina, *Prohibition on Human Cloning Research, Decree No. 200/97 [Prohíbense los Experimentos de Clonación Relacionados con Seres Humanos]*, 1997
- G. Japan, *Law Concerning Regulation Relating to Human Cloning Techniques and Other Similar Techniques*, 2001
- H. Norway, *Act No. 100 on the Use of Biotechnology in Human Medicine: The Biotechnology Law [Lov om humanmedisinsk bruk av bioteknologi m.m.: bioteknologiloven]*, 2003
- I. Republic of South Africa, *National Health Bill*, 2003
- J. Canada, *Assisted Human Reproduction Act of 2004*, 2004
- K. France, *Law on Bioethics*, 2004
- L. New Zealand, *Human Assisted Reproductive Technology Act*, 2004

United States Presidential Bioethics Councils

- M. President's Council on Bioethics, *Reproduction and Responsibility: The Regulation of New Biotechnologies*, 2004
- N. Presidential Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues, *New Directions: The Ethics of Synthetic Biology and Emerging Technologies*, 2010

United States and International NGOs and Policy Institutes, and Scholars

- O. Wingspread Conference on the Precautionary Principle, *The Wingspread Consensus Statement on the Precautionary Principle*, 1998
- P. Council for Responsible Genetics, *The Genetic Bill of Rights*, 2000
- Q. The People's Health Movement, *The People's Charter for Health*, 2000
- R. Asian Communities for Reproductive Justice, *A New Vision for Advancing our Movement for Reproductive Health, Reproductive Rights, and Reproductive Justice*, 2005

- S. The International Center for Technology Assessment, *Principles for the Oversight of Nanotechnologies and Nanomaterials*, 2007
- T. Center for American Progress, *Progressive Bioethics Initiative: Progressive Vision and Values*, 2007
- U. Pro-Choice Alliance for Responsible Research (PCARR), *Our Values*
- V. World Institute on Disability (WID), *Values: Working Towards Equality of Human Biotechnologies*, 2006

Religious Bodies

- W. Biotechnology Reference Group of the Canadian Council of Churches, *Beginning Biotechnology Guidelines*, 2005

Independent Scholars

- X. Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, *The Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 1983
- Y. Francis Fukuyama and Franco Furger, *Beyond Bioethics: A Proposal for Modernizing the Regulation of Human Biotechnologies*, 2006

Appendix: Categories of Core Values and Principles

A. COUNCIL OF EUROPE, *Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity of the Human Being with Regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine: Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine* (The Oviedo Convention), 1997

Core Values/Principles:

Article 1. Purpose and object.

- Parties to this Convention shall protect the dignity and identity of all human beings and guarantee everyone, without discrimination, respect for their integrity and other rights and fundamental freedoms with regard to the application of biology and medicine. Each Party shall take in its internal law the necessary measures to give effect to the provisions of this Convention.

Article 2. Primacy of the human being

- The interests and welfare of the human being shall prevail over the sole interest of society or science.

Article 3. Equitable access to health care

- Parties, taking into account health needs and available resources, shall take appropriate measures with a view to providing, within their jurisdiction, equitable access to health care of appropriate quality.

Article 4. Professional standards

- Any intervention in the health field, including research, must be carried out in accordance with relevant professional obligations and standards.

B. UNESCO, *Universal Declaration on the Human Genome and Human Rights*, 1998

Core Values/Principles:

1) Human dignity and the human genome

- Article 1. The human genome underlies the fundamental unity of all members of the human family, as well as the recognition of their inherent dignity and diversity. In a symbolic sense, it is the heritage of humanity.
- Article 2
 - (a) Everyone has a right to respect for their dignity and for their rights regardless of their genetic characteristics.
 - (b) That dignity makes it imperative not to reduce individuals to their genetic characteristics and to respect their uniqueness and diversity.
- Article 3. The human genome, which by its nature evolves, is subject to mutations. It contains potentialities that are expressed differently according to each individual's natural and social environment, including the individual's state of health, living conditions, nutrition and education.
- Article 4. The human genome in its natural state shall not give rise to financial gains.

2) Rights of the persons concerned

- Article 5.
 - (a) Research, treatment or diagnosis affecting an individual's genome shall be undertaken only after rigorous and prior assessment of the potential risks and benefits pertaining thereto and in accordance with any other requirement of national law.
 - (b) In all cases, the prior, free and informed consent of the person concerned shall be obtained. If the latter is not in a position to consent, consent or authorization shall be obtained in the manner prescribed by law, guided by the person's best interest.
 - (c) The right of each individual to decide whether or not to be informed of the results of genetic examination and the resulting consequences should be respected.
 - (d) In the case of research, protocols shall, in addition, be submitted for prior review in accordance with relevant national and international research standards or guidelines.
 - (e) If according to the law a person does not have the capacity to consent, research affecting his or her genome may only be carried out for his or her direct health benefit, subject to the authorization and the protective conditions prescribed by law. Research which does not have an expected direct health benefit may only be undertaken by way of exception, with the utmost restraint, exposing the person only to a minimal risk and minimal burden and if the research is intended to contribute to the health benefit of other persons in the same age category or with the same genetic condition, subject to the conditions prescribed by law, and provided such research is compatible with the protection of the individual's human rights.
- Article 6. No one shall be subjected to discrimination based on genetic characteristics that is intended to infringe or has the effect of infringing human rights, fundamental freedoms and human dignity.
- Article 7. Genetic data associated with an identifiable person and stored or processed for the purposes of research or any other purpose must be held confidential in the conditions set by law.
- Article 8. Every individual shall have the right, according to international and national law, to just reparation for any damage sustained as a direct and determining result of an intervention affecting his or her genome.
- Article 9. In order to protect human rights and fundamental freedoms, limitations to the principles of consent and confidentiality may only be prescribed by law, for compelling reasons within the bounds of public international law and the international law of human rights.

3) Research on the human genome

- Article 10. No research or research applications concerning the human genome, in particular in the fields of biology, genetics and medicine, should prevail over respect for the human rights, fundamental freedoms and human dignity of individuals or, where applicable, of groups of people.

- Article 11. Practices which are contrary to human dignity, such as reproductive cloning of human beings, shall not be permitted. States and competent international organizations are invited to co-operate in identifying such practices and in taking, at national or international level, the measures necessary to ensure that the principles set out in this Declaration are respected.
- Article 12
 - (a) Benefits from advances in biology, genetics and medicine, concerning the human genome, shall be made available to all, with due regard for the dignity and human rights of each individual.
 - (b) Freedom of research, which is necessary for the progress of knowledge, is part of freedom of thought. The applications of research, including applications in biology, genetics and medicine, concerning the human genome, shall seek to offer relief from suffering and improve the health of individuals and humankind as a whole.

4) Conditions for the exercise of scientific activity

- Article 13. The responsibilities inherent in the activities of researchers, including meticulousness, caution, intellectual honesty and integrity in carrying out their research as well as in the presentation and utilization of their findings, should be the subject of particular attention in the framework of research on the human genome, because of its ethical and social implications. Public and private science policy-makers also have particular responsibilities in this respect.
- Article 14. States should take appropriate measures to foster the intellectual and material conditions favourable to freedom in the conduct of research on the human genome and to consider the ethical, legal, social and economic implications of such research, on the basis of the principles set out in this Declaration.
- Article 15. States should take appropriate steps to provide the framework for the free exercise of Research on the human genome with due regard for the principles set out in this Declaration, in order to safeguard respect for human rights, fundamental freedoms and human dignity and to protect public health. They should seek to ensure that research results are not used for non-peaceful purposes.
- Article 16. States should recognize the value of promoting, at various levels, as appropriate, the establishment of independent, multidisciplinary and pluralist ethics committees to assess the ethical, legal and social issues raised by research on the human genome and its applications.

5) Solidarity and international co-operation

- Article 17. States should respect and promote the practice of solidarity towards individuals, families and population groups who are particularly vulnerable to or affected by disease or disability of a genetic character. They should foster, inter alia, research on the identification, prevention and treatment of genetically based and genetically influenced diseases, in particular rare as well as endemic diseases which affect large numbers of the world's population.
- Article 18. States should make every effort, with due and appropriate regard for the principles set out in this Declaration, to continue fostering the international dissemination of scientific knowledge concerning the human genome, human diversity and genetic research and, in that regard, to foster scientific and cultural co-operation, particularly between industrialized and developing countries.
- Article 19
 - (a) In the framework of international co-operation with developing countries, states should seek to encourage measures enabling:
 - (i) assessment of the risks and benefits pertaining to research on the human genome to be carried out and abuse to be prevented;
 - (ii) the capacity of developing countries to carry out research on human biology and genetics, taking into consideration their specific problems, to be developed and strengthened;
 - (iii) developing countries to benefit from the achievements of scientific and technological research so that their use in favour of economic and social progress can be to the benefit of all;
 - (iv) the free exchange of scientific knowledge and information in the areas of biology, genetics and medicine to be promoted.
 - (b) Relevant international organizations should support and promote the initiatives taken by states for the above-mentioned purposes.

C. EUROPEAN UNION, *Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, 2000*

Core Values/Principles (selected):

1) Dignity

- Article 1: Human Dignity: Human dignity is inviolable. It must be respected and protected.
- Article 2: Right to life: Everyone has the right to life.
- Article 3: Right to the Integrity of the Person.

Through free and informed consent, prohibition of eugenic practices, and prohibition of reproductive cloning of human beings.

2) Freedoms

- Article 6: Right to Liberty and Security: Everyone has the right to liberty and security of person.
- Article 7: Respect for private and family life: Everyone has the right to respect for his or her private and family life, home and communications.
- Article 9: Right to marry and right to found a family.
- Article 13: Freedom of the Arts and Sciences: The arts and scientific research shall be free of constraint. Academic freedom shall be respected.

3) Equality

- Article 21: Non-Discrimination: Any discrimination based on any ground such as sex, race, colour, ethnic or social origin, genetic features, language, religion or belief, political or any other opinion, membership of a national minority, property, birth, disability, age or sexual orientation shall be prohibited.

4) Solidarity

- Article 35: Health care: Everyone has the right of access to preventive health care and the right to benefit from medical treatment under the conditions established by national laws and practices. A high level of human health protection shall be ensured in the definition and implementation of all Union policies and activities.
- Article 37: Environmental Protection: A high level of environmental protection and the improvement of the quality of the environment must be integrated into the policies of the Union and ensured in accordance with the principle of sustainable development.

5) Citizens' Rights

6) Justice

D. THE EARTH CHARTER INITIATIVE, *The Earth Charter*, 2000

Core Values/Principles:

I) Respect and care for the community of life

- 1) Respect Earth and life in all its diversity.
- 2) Care for the community of life with understanding, compassion, and love.
- 3) Build democratic societies that are just, participatory, sustainable, and peaceful.
- 4) Secure Earth's bounty and beauty for present and future generations.

II) Ecological Integrity

- 5) Protect and restore the integrity of Earth's ecological systems, with special concern for biological diversity and the natural processes that sustain life.
- 6) Prevent harm as the best method of environmental protection and, when knowledge is limited, apply a precautionary approach.
- 7) Adopt patterns of production, consumption, and reproduction that safeguard Earth's regenerative capacities, human rights, and community well-being.
- 8) Advance the study of ecological sustainability and promote the open exchange and wide application of the knowledge acquired.

III) Social and Economic Justice

- 9) Eradicate poverty as an ethical, social, and environmental imperative.
- 10) Ensure that economic activities and institutions at all levels promote human development in an equitable and sustainable manner.
- 11) Affirm gender equality and equity as prerequisites to sustainable development and ensure universal access to education, health care, and economic opportunity.
- 12) Uphold the right of all, without discrimination, to a natural and social environment supportive of human dignity, bodily health, and spiritual well-being, with special attention to the rights of indigenous peoples and minorities.

IV) Democracy, Nonviolence, and Peace

- 13) Strengthen democratic institutions at all levels, and provide transparency and accountability in governance, inclusive participation in decision making, and access to justice.
- 14) Integrate into formal education and life-long learning the knowledge, values, and skills needed for a sustainable way of life.
- 15) Treat all living beings with respect and consideration.
- 16) Promote a culture of tolerance, nonviolence, and peace.

E. UNESCO, *Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights*, 2005

Core Values/Principles:

Article 3. Human dignity and human rights

Article 4. Benefit and harm

Article 5. Autonomy and individual responsibility

Article 6. Consent

Article 7. Persons without the capacity to consent

Article 8. Respect for human vulnerability and personal integrity

Article 9. Privacy and confidentiality

Article 10. Equality, justice and equity

Article 11. Non-discrimination and non-stigmatization

Article 12. Respect for cultural diversity and pluralism

Article 13. Solidarity and cooperation

Article 14. Social responsibility and health

Article 15. Sharing of benefits

Article 16. Protecting future generations

Article 17. Protection of the environment, the biosphere and biodiversity

F. ARGENTINA, *Prohibition on Human Cloning Research, Decree No. 200/97 [Prohíbense los experimentos de clonación relacionados con seres humanos], 1997*

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) It is the function of the government to defend human dignity of all human beings.
- 2) It is the function of the government to preserve the health and quality of life of human beings.
- 3) Scientific advances in cloning technology create ethical problems that opposes their own cultural values making it necessary to regulate all cloning experiments in relation to human beings.

G. JAPAN, Law Concerning Regulation Relating to Human Cloning Techniques and Other Similar Techniques, 2001

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) The preservation of human dignity.
- 2) Safety for human life and body.
- 3) Maintenance of social order.

**H. NORWAY, Act No. 100 on the Use of Biotechnology in Human Medicine: The Biotechnology Law
[Lov om humanmedisinsk bruk av bioteknologi m.m.: bioteknologiloven], 2003**

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) Respect for human dignity.
- 2) Respect for human rights.
- 3) Respect for personal integrity.
- 4) There will be no discrimination on the basis of genetic constitution.
- 5) There will be no discrimination on the basis of the ethical norms that form part of our Western cultural heritage.

I. REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA, *National Health Bill*, 2003

Core Values/Principles:

The preamble to the bill recognizes:

- 1) The socio-economic injustices, imbalances and inequities of health services of the past.
- 2) The need to heal the divisions of the past and to establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights.
- 3) The need to improve the quality of life of all citizens and to free the potential of each person.

J. CANADA, *Assisted Human Reproduction Act of 2004*

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) The health and well-being of children born through the application of assisted human reproductive technologies must be given priority in all decisions respecting their use;
- 2) The benefits of assisted human reproductive technologies and related research for individuals, for families and for society in general can be most effectively secured by taking appropriate measures for the protection and promotion of human health, safety, dignity and rights in the use of these technologies and in related research;
- 3) While all persons are affected by these technologies, women more than men are directly and significantly affected by their application and the health and well-being of women must be protected in the application of these technologies;
- 4) The principle of free and informed consent must be promoted and applied as a fundamental condition of the use of human reproductive technologies;
- 5) Persons who seek to undergo assisted reproduction procedures must not be discriminated against, including on the basis of their sexual orientation or marital status;
- 6) Trade in the reproductive capabilities of women and men and the exploitation of children, women and men for commercial ends raise health and ethical concerns that justify their prohibition; and
- 7) Human individuality and diversity, and the integrity of the human genome, must be preserved and protected.

K. FRANCE, Law on Bioethics No 2004-80, 2004

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) Respect for the dignity of the human embryo.
- 2) Respect for all stages of life.
- 3) Human Rights.

L. NEW ZEALAND, Human Assisted Reproductive Technology Act, 2004.

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) The health and well-being of children born as a result of the performance of an assisted reproductive procedure or an established procedure should be an important consideration in all decisions about that procedure.
- 2) The human health, safety, and dignity of present and future generations should be preserved and promoted.
- 3) While all persons are affected by assisted reproductive procedures and established procedures, women, more than men, are directly and significantly affected by their application, and the health and well-being of women must be protected in the use of these procedures.
- 4) No assisted reproductive procedure should be performed on an individual and no human reproductive research should be conducted on an individual unless the individual has made an informed choice and given informed consent.
- 5) Donor offspring should be made aware of their genetic origins and be able to access information about those origins.
- 6) The needs, values, and beliefs of Māori should be considered and treated with respect.
- 7) The different ethical, spiritual, and cultural perspectives in society should be considered and treated with respect.

M. PRESIDENT'S COUNCIL ON BIOETHICS, *Reproduction and Responsibility: The Regulation of New Biotechnologies*, 2004

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) Preserving a Reasonable Boundary between the Human and the Nonhuman (or, between the Human and the Animal) in Human Procreation.
- 2) Respect for Women and Human Pregnancy, Preventing Certain Exploitative and Degrading Practices.
- 3) Respect for Children Conceived with the Aid of Assisted Reproductive Technologies, Securing for Them the Same Rights and Human Attachments Naturally Available to Children Conceived In Vivo.
- 4) Setting Some Agreed-Upon Boundaries on How Embryos May Be Used and Treated

N. PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION FOR THE STUDY OF BIOETHICAL ISSUES, *New Directions: The Ethics of Synthetic Biology and Emerging Technologies*, 2010

Core Values/Principles:

1) Public Beneficence

- In order to maximize public benefits and minimize public harm, the commission made the following recommendations for improving biomedical research.

2) Responsible Stewardship

- To forward the obligations to both future generations and to global communities, the Commission “believes that the field of synthetic biology can proceed responsibly by embracing a middle ground – an ongoing process of prudent vigilance that carefully monitors, identifies, and mitigates potential and realized harms over time.”

3) Intellectual Freedom and Responsibility

- The Commission seeks to balance the need for responsible research without putting unnecessary limits on intellectual freedom. Therefore they urge the following recommendations without issuing a moratorium on research, calling instead for increased government oversight.

4) Democratic Deliberation

- People with contrasting positions on synthetic biology will have a voice and participate in equal exchange, helping to fully explore the possible implications of this new research.

5) Justice and Fairness

- The following recommendations bring attention to the need for government to address the distribution of risks and benefits.

**O. WINGSPREAD CONFERENCE ON THE PRECAUTIONARY PRINCIPLE, The Wingspread
Consensus Statement on the Precautionary Principle, 1998**

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) When an activity raises threats of harm to human health or the environment, precautionary measures should be taken even if some cause and effect relationships are not fully established scientifically.

P. COUNCIL FOR RESPONSIBLE GENETICS, The Genetic Bill Of Rights, 2000

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) All people have the right to preservation of the earth's biological and genetic diversity.
- 2) All people have the right to a world in which living organisms cannot be patented, including human beings, animals, plants, microorganisms and all their parts.
- 3) All people have the right to a food supply that has not been genetically engineered.
- 4) All indigenous peoples have the right to manage their own biological resources, to preserve their traditional knowledge, and to protect these from expropriation and biopiracy by scientific, corporate or government interests.
- 5) All people have the right to protection from toxins, other contaminants, or actions that can harm their genetic makeup and that of their offspring.
- 6) All people have the right to protection against eugenic measures such as forced sterilization or mandatory screening aimed at aborting or manipulating selected embryos or fetuses.
- 7) All people have the right to genetic privacy including the right to prevent the taking or storing of bodily samples for genetic information without their voluntary informed consent.
- 8) All people have the right to be free from genetic discrimination.
- 9) All people have the right to DNA tests to defend themselves in criminal proceedings.
- 10) All people have the right to have been conceived, gestated, and born without genetic manipulation.

Q. THE PEOPLE'S HEALTH MOVEMENT, *The People's Charter For Health*, 2000

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) The attainment of the highest possible level of health and well-being is a fundamental human right, regardless of a person's color, ethnic background, religion, gender, age, abilities, sexual orientation or class.
- 2) The principles of universal, comprehensive Primary Health Care (PHC), envisioned in the 1978 Alma Ata Declaration, should be the basis for formulating policies related to health. Now more than ever an equitable, participatory and intersectoral approach to health and health care is needed.
- 3) Governments have a fundamental responsibility to ensure universal access to quality health care, education and other social services according to people's needs, not according to their ability to pay.
- 4) The participation of people and people's organizations is essential to the formulation, implementation and evaluation of all health and social policies and programs.
- 5) Health is primarily determined by the political, economic, social and physical environment and should, along with equity and sustainable development, be a top priority in local, national and international policy-making.

R. ASIAN COMMUNITIES FOR REPRODUCTIVE JUSTICE, *A New Vision for Advancing Our Movement for Reproductive Health*, 2005

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) Recognize and support the leadership and power of the most excluded groups of women and girls.
- 2) Support the full expression of identity and sexuality.
- 3) Build alliances across differences of race, class, gender, sexuality, ability, immigration
- 4) status, age, and all other differences.
- 5) Recognize and address the multi-layered impact of power and oppression, whether
- 6) internalized or externalized.

S. THE INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR TECHNOLOGY ASSESSMENT, *Principles for the Oversight of Nanotechnologies and Nanomaterials, 2007*

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) A Precautionary Foundation
- 2) Mandatory Nano-specific Regulations
- 3) Health and Safety of the Public and Workers
- 4) Environmental Protection
- 5) Transparency
- 6) Public Participation
- 7) Inclusion of Broader Impacts
- 8) Manufacturer Liability

T. CENTER FOR AMERICAN PROGRESS, *Progressive Bioethics Initiative: Progressive Vision and Values*, 2007

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) Human Dignity: Promote the ability of individuals to achieve a sense of their unique worth and pursue their vision of the good life.
- 2) Critical Optimism: Support a science that improves our lives, frees our imagination, and is responsive to our human values.
- 3) Equity: Ensure equal access to the benefits of modern society, including health care and medical technology.
- 4) Social Justice: Support social and economic policies that respect and protect the lives and health of all people.

U. PRO-CHOICE ALLIANCE FOR RESPONSIBLE RESEARCH (PCARR), *Our Values*

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) We believe that social justice, safety, human rights and dignity for women must be paramount in public policy and private practice in emerging biotechnologies.
- 2) We believe that treatments, devices, and pharmaceuticals developed with public funds should be accessible and affordable to all.
- 3) We believe in respect for women as decision-makers about their own health, and that in order to make good decisions about participation in research, women must be given accurate and unbiased information and be free from coercive, misleading, and deceptive practices.
- 4) We believe that particular attention must be paid to vulnerable research subjects, especially given the history of exploitation in medical research of women, people of color, the mentally ill, and people with disabilities.
- 5) We believe that conflicts of interest undermine the quality of research performed, the protection of research subjects, and access to care. They should be eliminated.

In regards to stem cell and genetic research:

- 6) We believe there must be appropriate public oversight and accountability of stem cell research, including research conducted under California's Proposition 71.
- 7) We believe that egg extraction for research purposes poses serious risks to women's health and fertility, and therefore, if allowed, must be done only under the highest standards to minimize those risks. Women who wish to provide eggs for research should be offered alternatives to ovarian stimulation.
- 8) We believe that genes, stem cell lines, and human genetic materials should not be patented.

V. WORLD INSTITUTE ON DISABILITY (WID), *Values: Working Towards Equality*

Core Values/Principles:

WID aspires to work in a world with cultures where:

- 1) Disability is a natural part of the human condition,
- 2) People with disabilities have equal rights to their own self determination,
- 3) People with disabilities drive public policy issues and priorities,
- 4) Disability is a global issue,
- 5) People with disabilities have the right to make informed choices,
- 6) Information and education promote employment for all,
- 7) People with disabilities have the right to earn a living and live independently,
- 8) Accessible, affordable health care and community supports are essential rights that support employment and well being,
- 9) The disability experience is in the arts, media and wider culture, and
- 10) Information technologies are accessible to all people with disabilities.

**W. BIOTECHNOLOGY REFERENCE GROUP OF THE CANADIAN COUNCIL OF CHURCHES,
*Beginning Biotechnology Guidelines, 2005.***

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) Keep utility and vision in a creative balance. A utilitarian assessment, in a post-modern world, may seem an inviting way to deal with ethical issues. But that method tilts us towards thinking that the “end” we see as good always justifies the “means.” By contrast, to have a vision is to acknowledge that some boundaries matter, that some obligations are permanent. For example: health care spending should not rush after some stunning new technological breakthrough that will mostly benefit the few, the rich or the powerful, if paying for such innovations will leave unmet the needs of the poor and disadvantaged.
- 2) Recognize that stewardship must be understood as service with creation, not self-serving human exploitation. All of creation belongs to God. Humanity is called to use its creativity for the well-being of creation as a whole, in the spirit of stewardship and discipleship. Biotechnological innovations must be disciplined by a prior respect for all of creation, by a reverent concern to understand the contribution each part makes to the whole of creation.
- 3) Consider all the potential benefits and potential harms of new technologies on living and non-living aspects of creation. We need always to ask who is paying the price for the benefits we seek, how high is the price they pay, and who (if anyone!) is speaking for them. Those needs (human and non-human) can and might serve to show us appropriate and important limits on our actions.
- 4) Challenge misleading or over-simplifying rhetoric about advances and promises in biotechnology and nanotechnology. Ensure in-depth reflection on all the implications of any proposed action, not only the economic ones, and not only the ones affecting our immediate environment or society. Press for transparency and accountability by decision makers. Challenge the assumption that everything needs to be “fixed” or “improved”; that we know how best to do this; and that just because something can be done does not mean that it will be done, or ought to be done.
- 5) Recognize the inherent dignity of life, and resist the temptation to reduce life to commodities. Commodities are valued only for the price they can bring or the uses they can be put to. Particular techniques, particular claims of ownership or of intellectual property rights should be examined to see if they imply a disregard for the inherent dignity of non-human living creatures or of other human beings, and if so, on those grounds resisted.
- 6) Do justice, love kindness, and walk humbly with God (see Micah 6:8). This means assessing new technologies from the standpoint of the poor, the marginalized, and those least able to make their voices heard in the world’s clamour. Be still. Pay attention, listen, discern, and be willing to be led by those lacking access to political, economic or technological power.
- 7) Resist the temptation to rush decisions. The “handiest” of means to a desired end is not always the one that promotes the future well being of all. Sometimes we must decline to exercise our “power over” so as to resist the quick and easy but ethically slippery path to a desirable goal. We need to make room for “ethical time”, which is often slower than “technological time” or “market time.”
- 8) Recruit and work to ensure full community participation in contemplating decisions with ethical implications. We are born in the middle of life. From our beginning we are part of a community, formed by it, supported by it. Responsible ethical analysis is made in the context of full dialogue

with others, especially those who directly and indirectly (marginalized) will be affected by the decisions we make.

- 9) Consider decisions on birth, life, and death in light of God's providential care over and concern for all aspects of life and death, and the future of the world. Romans (8:38-39) makes it clear that in Christ neither death, nor life, nor things present, nor things to come will be able to separate us from the love of God.
- 10) Encourage legislation that protects the physical, biological, and ethical integrity of ourselves and our communities and future of the world. Biotechnology and nano-technology exist within the interactive matrix of creation. To ignore our responsibility to this dynamic interrelation as we pursue our creative activities is to court disaster for future generations.
- 11) Encourage and acknowledge additions and adjustments to these ethical considerations in accord with ways that specific religious traditions may also rightly, in light of the above, wish to add their specific concerns and insights as biotechnology advances.

X. Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, *The Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 1983.

Core Values/Principles:

1) Respect for Autonomy

- A norm of respecting the decision-making capacities of autonomous persons.

2) Nonmaleficence

- A norm of avoiding the causations of harm.

3) Beneficence

- A group of norms for providing benefits and balancing benefits against risks and costs.

4) Justice

- A group of norms for distributing benefits, risks, and costs fairly.

Y. FRANCIS FUKUYAMA & FRANCO FURGER, *Beyond Bioethics: A Proposal for Modernizing the Regulation of Human Biotechnologies*, 2006

Core Values/Principles:

- 1) The well-being and health of children should be protected.
- 2) Biomedical procedures on human embryos must respect their intermediate moral status.
- 3) Access to ARTs on the part of infertile couples should be promoted.
- 4) The well-being and health of women should be protected.
- 5) Free and informed consent must be required on the part of those making use of ARTs.
- 6) Limits on the commercialization of eggs, sperm, and embryos should be imposed.
- 7) Therapeutic uses should be favored over enhancement uses of biomedicine.

APPENDIX:

CATEGORIES OF CORE VALUES AND PRINCIPLES

The list below attempts to sort the values and principles most commonly invoked in the twenty-five documents included in this compendium under a limited set of categories. The number in parentheses shows the number of times that the identified value or principle is cited as a core value or principle in the twenty-five documents. Given the disparate nature of the documents under review and the different ways in which similar values and principles may be phrased, some degree of subjective judgment is involved in creating these categories and assigning counts to them. Not every value or principle referred to in the twenty-five documents is assigned to one of these categories; some values or principles were so specific to a particular biotechnology or constituency that they occurred only once, and are not included here.

- Anti-discrimination/equality/justice (17)
- Human rights (14)
- Promotion of and right to health (13)
- Human dignity (13)
- Promote responsible research / remove conflicts of interest (11)
- Free and informed consent (9)
- The well-being of women (7)
- Research freedom / foster research (7)
- Anti-commercialization / commercial liabilities (6)
- Environmental Protection (6)
- Solidarity (5)
- Respect for life / personal integrity / human boundaries (5)
- Democratic deliberation / right to voice (5)
- The well-being of children (4)
- The need for ethics committees and/or regulatory bodies (3)
- The need for the precautionary principle (2)